

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

ERNIE HINES D/B/A COLORFUL MUSIC)
Plaintiff) Action No.
v.)
EMI APRIL MUSIC INC.,)
EMI BLACKWOOD MUSIC INC. and) COMPLAINT
WARNER CHAPPELL MUSIC INC.)
SHAWN CARTER p/k/a JAY-Z and)
TIMOTHY MOSLEY p/k/a TIMBALAND)
Defendants)
)

JURISDICTION

1. Jurisdiction is based on diversity of citizenship and federal question. The amount in controversy exceeds Two Million Dollars (\$2,000,000.00).

PARTIES

2. Ernie Hines d/b/a Colorful Music ("Hines") has an address of 227 Elgin Ave. Apt 2A Forest Park, IL 60130.

3. EMI April Music Inc. ("EMI 1") has an address of 550 Madison Ave., New York, NY 10022, 25 Madison Ave, New York, NY 10010, and 245 Fifth Ave, Suite 1101, New York, NY 10016. The Registered Agent for EMI 1 is Corporation Service Company, 80 State Street, Albany, NY 12207.

4. EMI Blackwood Music Inc. ("EMI 2") has an address of 550 Madison Ave., New York, NY 10022 and 25 Madison Ave, New York, NY 10010 and 245 Fifth Ave, Suite 1101, New York, NY 10016. The Registered Agent for EMI 2 is Corporation Service Company, 80 State Street, Albany, NY 12207.

5. Warner Chappell Music Inc. ("WC") is a Delaware entity with an address of 777 South Santa Fe Ave, Los Angeles, CA 90021 and 1633 Broadway, New York, NY, 10019. CT Corporation System is the registered agent for WC with an address of 28 Liberty Street, New York, NY 10005. WC does business in the State of New York.

6. Shawn Carter p/k/a (“Carter” or “Jay-Z”) is an American mogul and rapper, resides at 195 Hudson Street, New York, NY 10013 and has a business address of Roc Nation LLC, 540 West 26th Street, New York, NY 10001.

7. Timothy Mosley p/k/a (“Mosley” or “Timbaland”) is an American music producer. He is the owner of Timbaland Productions Inc., a Virginia entity, ID No. 05264957, with a business address of L.L. Business Management Inc., 3000 Marcus Ave. Suite 1W5, Lake Success, NY 11042 on file with the Virginia Secretary of State’s Office. Mosley also has an address of 5400 Hammock Drive, Coral Gables, FL 33156, also known as 5400 SW 92nd Street, Coral Gables, FL, 33156.

FACTS

8. Hines is the co-author and composer of the song “Help Me Put Out The Flame (In My Heart)” (“Help Me”) which Hines registered with the United States Copyright Office. It was originally registered in 1969 and has a renewal registration of EU0000154302 and a renewal and addendum registration of RE0000932464. The song was released on Stax Records over forty (40) years ago. “Help Me” was also released in 1993 on The Complete Stax Volt Soul Singles. See <https://www.allmusic.com/album/the-complete-stax-volt-soul-singles-vol-2-1968-1971-mw0000622330>. The 1993 version of “Help Me” has a United States Copyright Registration of PA 2-184-476.

Help Me

9. The musical composition for “Help Me” and the copyrights relating to “Help Me”, contain a guitar riff and musical crescendo at the beginning of the song/composition. The guitar riff and musical crescendo are original and contains protectable elements which have been copyrighted by Hines.

10. The musical composition “Help Me” which contains a protectable guitar riff and musical crescendo, was used in the musical composition for “Paper Chase”. The songs “Help Me” and “Paper Chase” are substantially similar. The authors and copyright claimants of “Paper Chase” used the protectable guitar riff and musical crescendo in the musical composition of “Help Me” to create the musical composition of “Paper Chase”. The use of “Help Me” in the composition “Paper Chase” infringes on Plaintiff’s rights. EMI 2 is the copyright claimant for Paper Chase which has a copyright registration number of PA0001320423. Mosley and Carter are the alleged authors of “Paper Chase”.

11. Upon information and belief, Timothy Mosley (“Mosley”), one of the authors of “Paper Chase”, used the musical composition of “Help Me” again, and placed the

protectable guitar riff and musical crescendo into the musical composition for “Toe 2 Toe” which Mosley contends he co-authored. The songs “Toe 2 Toe” and “Help Me” are substantially similar as Mosley included the protectable guitar riff and musical crescendo from the song “Help Me” in the composition for “Toe 2 Toe”. EMI 1 claims interest in the copyright for “Toe 2 Toe” through relationship with Virginia Beach Music and its related entities. “Toe 2 Toe” has a copyright registration number of PA0000987622.

12. Defendants have copyrighted, used or benefited from the protectable elements of “Help Me” in violation of Plaintiff’s rights under the Copyright Act and have placed the guitar riff and musical crescendo from “Help Me” into the compositions of “Paper Chase” and “Toe 2 Toe”.

Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life - 1998- Jay-Z

13. ***Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life*** (“HKL”) is the third studio album by American rapper Jay-Z. It was released on September 29, 1998 on Roc-A-Fella Records. It went on to become a commercially successful album, selling over 5 million (5,000,000) copies in the United States. See Exhibit A.

14. The album HKL contains the song “Paper Chase” which is performed by Jay-Z featuring the legendary female rapper “Foxy Brown” and is produced by Mosley. The credits on the song identify the composers/writers of the song as Jay-Z and Mosley. EMI 2 and WC also claim an interest in the exploitation of the copyright for “Paper Chase”.

15. EMI 2, WC, Jay-Z and Mosley knew or should have known that the song “Paper Chase” contained the guitar riff and musical crescendo from the composition of “Help Me” as performed by Hines. Due to the use of the protectable guitar riff and musical crescendo, “Help Me” and “Paper Chase” are substantially similar. Jay-Z and Mosley contend they are the authors of the song “Paper Chase”. EMI 2, WC, Jay-Z and Mosley claim ownership of the copyright or an interest in the copyright to “Paper Chase” registration number PA0001320423, which infringes on the copyright of “Help Me”.

16. EMI 2, WC, Jay-Z and Mosley, while working in conjunction with each other, have obtained millions of dollars associated with “Paper Chase” from the exploitation, sale, downloads, licensing, radio airplay, synchronization and digital streaming of the song in violation of Plaintiff’s rights. Hines is a senior citizen, does not listen to rap music and was unaware that “Paper Chase” contained his music and composition until 2018.

17. The credits for “Paper Chase” on Tidal, an entity owned by Jay-Z, clearly identifies the unauthorized use of the composition of “Help Me” and credits Ernie Hines for “Help Me”. See Exhibit B.

18. Upon information and belief, “Paper Chase” has been played millions of times on traditional, satellite and digital radio and appears on multiple compilation albums including the 2003 release, “Bring It On - The Best of Jay-Z”.

<https://www.discogs.com/Jay-Z-Bring-It-On-The-Best-Of/release/1031110> and the 2011 release “The Best Of Jay-Z” <https://www.discogs.com/Jay-Z-The-Best-Of/release/6244319>, released by Sony Music Entertainment. The continuous actions of EMI 2, WC, Jay-Z and Mosley infringe on the rights of the Plaintiff. WC, EMI 2, Jay-Z and Mosley received millions of dollars in the exploitation of the composition.

100%Ginuwine - 1999-Ginuwine

19. Upon information and belief, the same protectable elements of the musical composition of “Help Me” were included by EMI 1 and Mosley in the song “Toe 2 Toe” which was released on the Ginuwine album “100% Ginuwine” in March 1999 by Sony Music Entertainment. Registration number PA0000987622. “100% Ginuwine” has sold over 2 Million (2,000,000) copies to date. Exhibit C.

20. Mosley is identified as one of the composers of the song “Toe 2 Toe” on the Ginuwine song released by Sony Music Entertainment in 1999. “Toe 2 Toe” contains the protectable guitar riff and musical crescendo of “Help Me”. “Help Me” and “Toe 2 Toe” are substantially similar due to the use of the guitar riff and musical crescendo. Mosley and EMI 1 provided the song “Toe 2 Toe” (which infringes on the protectable guitar riff and musical crescendo in “Help Me”) to Sony Music Entertainment and other third parties.

21. Neither Mosley nor EMI 1 ever attempted to contact Hines to get his clearance to license the use of the protectable guitar riff and musical crescendo from the composition “Help Me” on the Ginuwine album in the song “Toe 2 Toe”. EMI 1 and Mosley claims an interest in the copyright for “Toe 2 Toe”.

22. EMI 1 and Mosley, while working together, have unlawfully infringed on Hines’ copyright and have converted the copyright for its own use. The infringement by EMI 1 and Mosley is knowing, willful and continuous. EMI 1 and Mosley never had Plaintiff’s consent nor did they ever seek Plaintiff’s consent for over twenty (20) years. Plaintiff learned of the use of his song “Help Me” in “Toe 2 Toe” in 2018.

23. Attached as Exhibit D is a report further detailing the protected elements of the musical composition “Help Me” which are substantially similar to “Paper Chase” and “Toe 2 Toe”. The report is incorporated by reference. The composition for “Help Me” is protected by three United States registered copyright filings (1) EU0000154302, (2) a renewal and addendum registration of RE0000932464 and (3) PA 2-184-476 which have all been infringed.

**COUNT I
COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT
17 U.S.C. § 501, 502, 504 and 505
AGAINST EMI APRIL MUSIC INC.**

24. Hines repeats and realleges each of the preceding paragraphs 1-23 above.
25. Hines is the co-author of "Help Me" which is registered in the United States Copyright Office.
26. EMI 1 with the assistance of Mosley, has unlawfully used the protectable elements of the musical composition of "Help Me" and never sought Plaintiff's approval to use the musical composition. EMI 1 claims an interest in the "Toe 2 Toe" copyright through its business relationship with Mosley and/or Virginia Beach Music, Inc.
27. EMI 1 has infringed on Plaintiff's rights under the United States Copyright Act. "Help Me" is substantially similar to "Toe 2 Toe".
28. EMI 1 with the assistance of Mosley, marketed, licensed and/or benefitted from the exploitation of the song "Toe 2 Toe" in violation of the Plaintiff's rights. "Toe 2 Toe" infringes on the musical composition of "Help Me" as the compositions are substantially similar.
29. Upon information and belief, EMI 1 licensed or benefitted from the licensing of "Toe 2 Toe" to Sony Music Entertainment and others, the radio airplay of "Toe 2 Toe" and the exploitation of the composition. "Help Me" and "Toe 2 Toe" are substantially similar and EMI 1 committed copyright infringement, violating Plaintiff's rights.
30. Upon information and belief, EMI 1 has received money for the infringing composition and has paid or caused other corporate entities to pay monies associated with the composition "Toe 2 Toe" including Mosley.
31. EMI 1, with the assistance of Mosley, have violated Plaintiff's rights to control, sell, market, and distribute derivate works of "Help Me". "Toe 2 Toe" infringes on the composition of "Help Me" in violation of Plaintiff's rights.
32. Hines seeks to (1) enjoin the activity of EMI 1 (2) actual or statutory damages per sale (3) Attorney's fees relating to Defendant's actions and (4) an injunction prohibiting the sale of the infringing composition.

COUNT II
COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT
17 U.S.C. § 501, 502, 504 and 505
AGAINST EMI BLACKWOOD MUSIC, INC.

33. Hines repeats and realleges each of the preceding paragraphs 1-23 above.
34. Hines is the co-author of “Help Me” which is registered in the United States Copyright Office.
35. EMI 2 has unlawfully used the protectable elements of the musical composition of “Help Me” and never sought Plaintiff’s approval to use the musical composition.
36. EMI 2 with the assistance of Jay-Z and Mosley, have infringed on Plaintiff’s rights under the United States Copyright Act. “Help Me” is substantially similar to “Paper Chase”.
37. EMI 2 with the assistance of Jay-Z and Mosley, marketed, licensed and/or benefitted from the exploitation of the song “Paper Chase” in violation of the Plaintiff’s rights. “Paper Chase” infringes on the musical composition of “Help Me” in violation of Plaintiff’s rights. “Help Me” and “Paper Chase” are substantially similar compositions.
38. Upon information and belief, EMI 2 with the assistance of Jay-Z and Mosley, has licensed or benefitted from the licensing of “Paper Chase” to third parties and the radio airplay of “Paper Chase” in violation of Plaintiff’s rights and collect funds in violation of Plaintiff’s rights.
39. Upon information and belief, EMI 2 has received money for the infringing composition and has paid or caused other corporate entities to pay Jay-Z and/or Mosley monies associated with the composition “Paper Chase”.
40. EMI 2 has violated Plaintiff’s rights to control, sell, market, and distribute “Help Me” and derivate works of “Help Me” and have committed copyright infringement.
41. Hines seeks to (1) enjoin the activity of EMI 2 (2) actual or statutory damages per sale (3) Attorney’s fees relating to Defendant’s actions and (4) an injunction prohibiting the sale of the infringing composition.

**COUNT III
COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT
17 U.S.C. § 501, 502, 504 and 505
AGAINST WARNER CHAPPELL MUSIC INC.**

42. Hines repeats and realleges each of the preceding paragraphs 1-23, 33-41 above.

43. Hines is the co-author of "Help Me" which is registered in the United States Copyright Office.

44. WC received an interest in "Paper Chase" through its relationship with Lil Lu Lu Publishing and/or Virginia Beach Music, Inc. and/or Mosley.

45. WC, Jay-Z and Mosley have unlawfully used the protectable elements of the musical composition of "Help Me" and never sought Plaintiff's approval to use the musical composition.

46. WC with the assistance of Jay-Z and Mosley, has infringed on Plaintiff's rights under the United States Copyright Act. "Help Me" is substantially similar to "Paper Chase".

47. WC 2 with assistance from Jay-Z and Mosley marketed, licensed and/or benefitted from the exploitation of the song "Paper Chase" in violation of the Plaintiff's rights. "Paper Chase" infringes on the musical composition of "Help Me" in violation of Plaintiff's rights.

48. Upon information and belief, WC, Jay-Z and Mosley have licensed or benefitted from the licensing of "Paper Chase" to third parties and the radio play, streaming and synchronization of "Paper Chase" and collected funds in violation of Plaintiff's rights.

49. Upon information and belief, WC has received money for the infringing composition and has paid or caused other corporate entities to pay Jay-Z and/or Mosely monies associated with the composition "Paper Chase".

50. WC with the assistance of Jay-Z and Mosley have violated Plaintiff's rights to control, sell, market, and distribute "Help Me" and derivate works of "Help Me" and have committed copyright infringement.

51. Hines seeks to (1) enjoin the activity of WC (2) actual or statutory damages per sale (3) Attorney's fees relating to Defendant's actions and (4) an injunction prohibiting the sale of the infringing composition.

COUNT IV
COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT
17 U.S.C. § 501, 502, 504 and 505
AGAINST SHAWN CARTER P/K/A JAY-Z

52. Hines repeats and realleges each of the preceding paragraphs 1-23, 33-51 above.
53. Hines is the co-author of “Help Me” which is registered in the United States Copyright Office.
54. Jay-Z is a composer of the song “Paper Chase”. Jay-Z unlawfully used the protectable elements of the musical composition of “Help Me” in the song “Paper Chase” and never sought Hines’ approval to use the musical composition. “Help Me” is substantially similar to “Paper Chase”. “Paper Chase” infringes on the musical composition of “Help Me” in violation of Plaintiff’s rights.
55. Jay-Z with assistance from EMI 2, WC and Mosley marketed, licensed and/or benefitted from the exploitation of the song “Paper Chase” in violation of the Plaintiff’s rights. “Paper Chase” infringes on the musical composition of “Help Me” in violation of Plaintiff’s rights.
56. Defendant Jay-Z claims an ownership interest in the composition for “Paper Chase” which contains the protectable elements of the composition “Help Me”. Carter, will working in conjunction with Mosley, EMI 2 and WC, provided the infringing song to record label and other third parties such as Universal Music Group, Sony Entertainment and others.
57. Jay Z has collected music publishing royalties from various entities in violation of Hines’ rights.
58. Jay-Z has harmed Plaintiff in his business.

COUNT V
COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT
17 U.S.C. § 501, 502, 504 and 505
AGAINST TIMOTHY MOSLEY P/K/A TIMBALAND
FOR THE COMPOSITION PAPER CHASE

59. Hines repeats and realleges each of the preceding paragraphs 1-23, and 33-58 above.

60. Hines is the co-author of “Help Me” which is registered in the United States Copyright Office.

61. Mosley is a composer of the song “Paper Chase”. Jay-Z unlawfully used the protectable elements of the musical composition of “Help Me” in the song “Paper Chase” and never sought Hines’ approval to use the musical composition. “Help Me” is substantially similar to “Paper Chase”. “Paper Chase” infringes on the musical composition of “Help Me” in violation of Plaintiff’s rights.

62. Mosley with assistance from EMI 2, WC and Jay-Z marketed, licensed and/or benefited from the exploitation of the song “Paper Chase” in violation of the Plaintiff’s rights. .

63. Mosley claims ownership of the composition for “Paper Chase” which contains the protectable elements of the composition “Help Me”. Mosley, while working in conjunction with Jay-Z, EMI 2 and WC, provided the infringing song to record label and other third parties.

64. Mosley has collected music publishing royalties from various entities in violation of Hines’ rights.

65. Mosley has harmed Plaintiff in his business.

COUNT VI
COPYRIGHT INFRINGEMENT
17 U.S.C. § 501, 502, 504 and 505
AGAINST TIMOTHY MOSLEY P/K/A TIMBALAND FOR
THE COMPOSITION TOE 2 TOE

66. Hines repeats and realleges each of the preceding paragraphs 1-32 above.

67. Hines is the co-author of “Help Me” which is registered in the United States Copyright Office.

68. Mosley is a composer of the song “Toe 2 Toe”. Timbaland unlawfully used the protectable elements of the musical composition of “Help Me” in the song “Toe 2 Toe” and never sought Hines’ approval to use the musical composition.

69. Mosley with the assistance of EMI 1, marketed, licensed and/or benefitted from the exploitation of the song “Toe 2 Toe” in violation of the Plaintiff’s rights. “Toe 2 Toe”

infringes on the musical composition of "Help Me" as the compositions are substantially similar.

70. Upon information and belief, Mosley with the assistance of EMI1, licensed or benefitted from the licensing of "Toe 2 Toe" to Sony Music Entertainment and others, the radio airplay of "Toe 2 Toe", and the exploitation of the composition.

71. Mosley has collected music publishing royalties from various entities in violation of Hines' rights.

72. Mosley has harmed Plaintiff in his business.

WHEREFORE, The Plaintiff demands a jury trial and the following:

1. Judgment on all counts and amount to be determined by the Court;
2. Interest;
3. Attorney's Fees;
4. A permanent injunction, and,
5. Any other relief this Court deems just and equitable.

ERNIE HINES D/B/A COLORFUL MUSIC
By His Attorneys,



Christopher Brown
CB3465
Brown & Rosen LLC
Attorneys At Law
100 State Street, Suite 900
Boston, MA 02109
617-728-9111 (T)

cbrown@brownrosen.com

Dated: May 6, 2020

EXHIBIT A

EXHIBIT B

TIDAL

LH TIDAL HiFi

What's New

TIDAL Rising

Playlists

Genres

Music Videos

Movies & Shows

My Music

Create New Playlist

< > SAMPLING: VOL. 2... HARD KNOCK LIFE

Sampling: Vol. 2... Hard Kn...

Created by: TIDAL Tracks: 19 Time: 1:20:04

"Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life" is without question one of the most important albums in JAY-Z's discography. It's filled with hit records that still resonate with fans today and also defines a pivotal moment in his career when he first became a multi-platinum rap superstar. Celebrate the 19th birthday of Hov's classic album (September 29) with these album highlights paired with the songs they sampled, including the historic use of the 'Annie' movie's "It's A Hard-Knock Life" theme song for the title track.

Play Favorite Share ...

#	TITLE	ARTIST	ALBUM
1	Intro - Hand It Down	JAY-Z, Memphis Bleek	Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life
	Are You Man Enough? (Single Version)	Four Tops	Shaft In Africa (Soundtrack)

TIDAL

< > SAMPLING: VOL. 2... HARD KNOCK LIFE



Sampling: Vol. 2... Hard Kn

Created by: TIDAL **Tracks:** 19 **Time:** 1:20:04

'Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life' is without question one of the most important albums in JAY-Z's discography. It's filled with hit records that still resonate with fans today and also defines a pivotal moment in his career when he first became a multi-platinum rap superstar. Celebrate the 19th birthday of Hov's classic (September 29) with these album highlights paired with the songs they sampled, including the historic use of the 'Annie' movie's "It's A Hard-Knock Life" theme song for the title track.

Play Favorite Share ...

#	TITLE	ARTIST	ALBUM
1	Intro - Hand It Down	JAY-Z, Memphis Bleek	Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life
2	Are You Man Enough? (Single Version)	Four Tops	Shaft In Africa (Soundtrack)

TIDAL

< > SAMPLING: VOL. 2... HARD KNOCK LIFE

3	Hard Knock Life (Ghetto Anthem)	JAY-Z	Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life
4	Annie: It's the Hard-Knock Life	Andrea McArdle, Annie Ensemble, et al.	Annie (Original Broadway Cast Recording)
5	Nigga What, Nigga Who (Originator 99)	JAY-Z, Big Jaz	Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life
6	Sunshine	Earth, Wind & Fire	Gratitude
7	Cheers 2 U	Playa	Cheers 2 U
8	A Week Ago	JAY-Z, Too \$hort	Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life
9	Ballad for the Fallen Soldier	The Isley Brothers	Between the Sheets
10	Paper Chase	JAY-Z, Foxy Brown	Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life
11	Help Me Put Out The Flame (In My Heart)	Ernie Hines	The Complete Stax / Volt Soul Anthology
12	Reservoir Dogs	JAY-Z, The Lox, Sauce Money, et al.	Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life
13	Theme From Shaft (Album - Remastered)	Isaac Hayes	Shaft (Deluxe Edition)
14	It's Like That	JAY-Z, Kid Capri	Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life
15	Beggar Song	Wet Willie	Wet Willie
16	It's Alright	Memphis Bleek, JAY-Z	Vol. 2... Hard Knock Life

EXHIBIT C



HOME | TITLE | SUMMARY | CHARTS | MARKETING | PICKUP | SETS | ARCHIVES | ACCOUNT | HELP

Title Report: National Sales LOAD TO EXCEL

Title: 100% GINUWINE Artist: GINUWINE Format: Album Label: COL Release Date: 03/16/99 Catalog: CAT:69598 2019 YTD: 328 2019 YTD Digital: 177	Tracks TW 268 RTD 510,074 YTD 4,111 Weeks Top 200 Period TW Rank LW 2W	Release To Date Sales <table border="1" style="margin-left: auto; margin-right: auto;"> <thead> <tr> <th></th> <th>Units</th> <th>% TOT</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Total:</td> <td>2,013,498</td> <td></td> </tr> <tr> <td>LP:</td> <td>1,732</td> <td>0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Cassette:</td> <td>344,424</td> <td>17</td> </tr> <tr> <td>CD:</td> <td>1,654,064</td> <td>82</td> </tr> <tr> <td>DVD:</td> <td>0</td> <td>0</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Digital:</td> <td>13,278</td> <td>1</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>		Units	% TOT	Total:	2,013,498		LP:	1,732	0	Cassette:	344,424	17	CD:	1,654,064	82	DVD:	0	0	Digital:	13,278	1
	Units	% TOT																					
Total:	2,013,498																						
LP:	1,732	0																					
Cassette:	344,424	17																					
CD:	1,654,064	82																					
DVD:	0	0																					
Digital:	13,278	1																					

Week Ending: 04/11/2019 Strata: All Config: All Weeks: 4 Display: % CHG

Strata: All Config: All	WK End 04/11/19	% CHG	RK	WK End 04/04/19	% CHG	RK	WK End 03/28/19	% CHG	RK	WK End 03/21/19	% CHG	RK
Total	10	-63		27	0		27	-13		31	0	
Store Strata												
Chain	1	0		1	0		1	0		1	-67	
Independent	0			0	-100		14	0		14	0	
Mass Merch	0			0			0			0		
Digital	8	-67		24	140		10	-38		16	33	
Non Traditional	1	-50		2	0		2			0	-100	
Internet/Mail Order/Venue	1	-50		2	0		2			0	-100	
Non Traditional Retail Outlets	0			0			0			0		
Geographic Region												
Northeast	0			0			0	-100		1		
Middle Atlantic	4	100		2			0			0	-100	
East North Central	1	-80		5	150		2	100		1	-50	
West North Central	0	-100		2	100		1	-50		2	100	
South Atlantic	4	-43		7	-67		21	162		8	-47	
South Central	1	-67		3	50		2	100		1	-75	
Mountain	0	-100		4	300		1	-50		2	0	
Pacific	0	-100		4			0	-100		16	167	
Geographic Place												
City	3	-70		10	-44		18	350		4	-82	
Suburb	4	-50		8	167		3	-50		6	0	
Rural	3	-67		9	50		6	-71		21	600	

EXHIBIT D

Joe Bennett Report dated September 8, 2019